

Technology, National Security and U\$-China Strategic Competition

With this issue, CNA's China and Indo-Pacific Security Affairs Division relaunches *Intersections*, a news digest describing the interplay between the People's Republic of China's (PRC's) technology acquisition efforts, US and partner nation responses, and critical and emerging technology risks to the US industrial base posed by those efforts. This issue features stories on counter-drone technology, undersea sensing and targeting, and PRC efforts to acquire semiconductor technology to support China's military artificial intelligence (AI) development.

Please click <u>here</u> to read *Intersections* in your browser.

THIS ISSUE'S CONTENTS

Counter-Drone Technology Developments	.2
Undersea Sensing and Targeting Advances	4
Semiconductors and Military Al	4

COUNTER-DRONE TECHNOLOGY DEVELOPMENTS

With the proliferation of a variety of uncrewed aircraft systems (UAS) and other uncrewed vehicles, as highlighted by the <u>extensive use</u> of high-volume, low-cost drones in the Russia-Ukraine war, interest in new technologies to counter or neutralize these systems has grown. The US military, the People's Liberation Army (PLA), and other militaries worldwide are investing heavily in counter-drone technology to attempt to defend against new drone-related threats.

This section looks at recent claimed advances in counter-UAS technology by both China and the US as reported in PRC media and the US press. We begin with a story about counter-UAS technologies that the PRC is expected to showcase at China's largest airshow, the Zhuhai Airshow, this November.

Counter-drone systems to be featured at upcoming Zhuhai Airshow. At a September press conference for the upcoming 15th China International Aviation and Aerospace Exhibition (the Zhuhai Airshow) to be held in Zhuhai, Guangdong Province, PRC, the airshow's organizers and representatives from a number of participating organizations previewed their plans for this year's iteration. The event, which is cohosted by the PLA Air Force and the Guangdong provincial government, is a high-profile display of aerospace and defense technologies that the PLA wants to showcase in public.²

According to the *South China Morning Post*, drone and counter-drone systems will be a particular focus of this year's airshow, which will feature a new exhibition space dedicated to drone systems and will debut multiple new or upgraded counter-drone systems.³ For example, the China Electronics Technology Group Corporation (CETC), a state-owned enterprise that produces military- and dual-use electronics, stated that it plans to display a new low-altitude radar defense system intended for use in counter-drone operations.⁴ Of note, in 2021, *Science and Technology Daily*, the official paper of the PRC Ministry of Science and Technology, reported on a similar low-altitude counter-drone radar developed by CETC. According to that report, the radar system's ability to detect low- and slow-flying small targets gives it an advantage over other air defense systems in detecting drones.⁵ Although the maturity and efficacy of such counter-drone systems remains to be seen, their expected prominent place at the Zhuhai Airshow suggests, at a minimum, a sustained PLA interest in pursuing and fielding advanced counter-drone systems.

CETC's development of radar and other advanced technologies has benefited from both illegal technology transfer and legal international research collaborations. In 2010, a US federal court found two individuals guilty of transferring military-use electronic components, including technologies used in military radars, to several PRC entities, including CETC.⁶ In addition, beginning in 2015, CETC built research relationships with at least three foreign research institutions: the University of Manchester in the United Kingdom, the University of Technology Sydney in Australia, and the Technical University Graz in Austria.⁷ Research topics under these collaborations have included radio astronomy instruments, wireless technology, and microsatellites.⁸

The PLA may have mounted a laser system with counter-drone uses on a naval ship. According to an August article in The War Zone, a US defense news website that describes the "use of open-source intelligence" as a "key facet of the site's reporting," recent photographs of a PLA Navy (PLAN) Type 071 amphibious transport dock suggest that the ship may have been equipped with a new laser weapon during a refit. The potential capabilities of such a system remain unclear, but The War Zone notes that they could include functioning as an optical dazzler and contributing to counter-drone defenses. 10

Although the purported addition has not been publicly confirmed and the system's capabilities (assuming that it exists) remain uncertain, authoritative PRC media commentary does indicate that the PLA is interested in developing and using laser technology, including as a counter-drone capability. For example, a February 2024 article published in *PLA Daily*, the PLA's official newspaper, asserts that directed energy weapons, including lasers, are well suited to providing low- and super-low-altitude air defense and are particularly effective at countering large drone swarms.¹¹ Similarly, another *PLA Daily* article from May 2024 assesses that although laser systems still face multiple technical obstacles, they will eventually gain an advantage over traditional air defense missiles and antiaircraft guns in combatting drones and drone swarms because of their lower cost and greater accuracy as well as their ability to modulate their power output.¹²

The PRC's efforts to develop laser technologies may benefit from illegal technology transfer. As discussed in <u>Issue 10</u> of *Intersections*, in April 2024, officials in Germany arrested three individuals for allegedly transferring a high-powered dual-use laser, as well as other sensitive data, to the PRC's Ministry of State Security—China's principal civilian intelligence agency.¹³ This is an example of how the PRC uses espionage and other illegal and sub rosa methods to illegally access, or "burglarize," foreign technologies.

PRC-Laos joint military exercises feature counter-drone technology, tactics. In July, approximately 300 PLA and 900 Laotian troops took part in joint exercises at the training grounds of the Kommadam Military Academy of the Lao People's Army, located on the outskirts of Vientiane, the capital.¹⁴ According to *PLA Daily*, during the exercises, soldiers from both nations participated in training exercises involving the use of drone countermeasures.¹⁵ A video published on the *PLA Daily* website about the counter-drone exercises reports that the exercise included training on countering reconnaissance drones, "bomb-carrying drones," and kamikaze drones.¹⁶ In the video, a PLA soldier states that they employed a variety of counter-drone systems and tactics, including using an "anti-drone gun" against reconnaissance drones, lasers to intercept "bomb-carrying drones," fast and agile first-person view (FPV) drones to collide with and therefore disable the bomb-carrying drones, and a "net gun" to catch and ground kamikaze drones.¹⁷

The drones shown in the video seem to be small quadcopter drones, a type of drone that is cheap and often available from commercial vendors. ¹⁸ Indeed, FPV drones were originally developed as hobbyist racing drones, and the FPV drone used in the video to collide with and disable other drones appears to be operated with a remote control made by DJI, a PRC commercial drone company. ¹⁹ The PRC currently dominates the commercial drone market, with DJI alone holding a <u>74 percent</u> global market share. ²⁰ DJI has received investments from the PRC government, ²¹ and two researchers affiliated with the Atlantic Council, a US international affairs think tank, argue that this financial support may contribute to DJI's current market power because it allegedly allows the company to sell its drones abroad at <u>below-market prices</u>. ²² As shown in the exercises discussed above, off-the-shelf drone technologies that originate in the civilian commercial sector are increasingly playing a role in PLA drone and counter-drone operations and are one example of how China seeks to benefit from its <u>civil-military fusion</u> strategy. ²³ In this context, the PRC's superiority in the commercial drone market could allow it to control the supply of a valuable future military technology and support PLA innovation in both drone and counter-drone tactics. ²⁴

UNDERSEA SENSING AND TARGETING ADVANCES

Undersea sensing is critical to submarine warfare and is expected to be a decisive factor in any future maritime conflict. In addition, emerging technologies such as uncrewed submersible systems and the deployment of AI for target recognition are expected to have significant effects on the future of warfighting in the undersea domain. Given the importance of these technologies, the PRC is using various tactics, including illegal activities, to acquire related components and information from overseas. This section looks at an advance claimed by China in sonar for uncrewed submersibles.

Researchers at PLA-affiliated institution reportedly develop high-power sonar system for use in uncrewed submersibles. In March 2024, the *South China Morning Post* reported that researchers at the National Key Laboratory of Underwater Acoustic Technology at Harbin Engineering University had announced in a peer-reviewed academic article that they had developed what may be the world's smallest phased array sonar system.²⁵ According to the research team, the small size of the newly developed sonar system means that it can be installed on small submersibles, including uncrewed submersibles. At the same time, because the system uses phased array sonar, it is more sensitive than traditional sonar systems.²⁶

The researchers' affiliation with Harbin Engineering University lends their discovery military significance. As a member of the "Seven Sons of National Defense," a group of seven PRC universities with deep ties to the PLA and PRC defense industry, Harbin Engineering University is a <u>leading center</u> for defense technology research and is closely affiliated with the PLAN.²⁷ Furthermore, the laboratory with which the research team is affiliated, the National Key Laboratory of Underwater Acoustic Technology, has previously developed <u>hydroacoustic technologies</u> for use in undersea warfare systems.²⁸ As such, the researchers' article provides insight into the technologies that the PLA is seeking to develop and field.

China's emphasis on advancing in submersible technology, particularly for military use, has led to attempts to acquire key components overseas via espionage, including involvement by Harbin Engineering University–affiliated individuals. In 2016, for example, Amin Yu, a Chinese national living in the US, was sentenced to federal prison for illegally obtaining systems and components for submersibles from US companies from 2002 to 2014.²⁹ Multiple coconspirators were listed in Yu's plea agreement, which specifies that these individuals were "working for" Harbin Engineering University and allegedly used the components Yu provided them to develop uncrewed underwater vehicles.³⁰ This case is an example of how personnel at PRC defense-affiliated universities have been linked to the theft of sensitive technologies with defense applications.

SEMICONDUCTORS AND MILITARY AI

As AI technology rapidly advances, including autonomous decision-making capabilities, global concern increases about the potential for military AI systems to cause unintended harm in either peacetime or wartime scenarios. Meanwhile, governments and militaries are concerned that whoever advances most rapidly in military AI development will gain a significant warfighting edge over competitors. This section looks at how the PRC is employing a range of tactics to continue acquiring a critical technology for AI development—advanced computer chips—despite US attempts to stem the flow of these chips to China through export controls.

PRC continues to advance in AI for military use, supported by evasion of US export controls. In October 2022, the US Department of Commerce's Bureau of Industry and Security (BIS) imposed controls on the export of advanced semiconductors to China.³¹ These controls, later updated in 2023,³² are intended to stem the flow of advanced chips that provide the high-end processing power to enable PRC military advances in areas such as AI.³³ However, according to an August 2024 New York Times report, PRC companies and chip importers have become increasingly creative at evading the restrictions and maintaining the flow of advanced chips into the PRC.³⁴ According to the report, these companies and individuals have engaged in the following tactics, among others:

- Smuggling chips into mainland China through third countries to which the export of advanced chips is legal, such as Singapore
- Creating a new company to manufacture servers designed for training Al models in partnership with US companies Nvidia, Intel, and Microsoft
- Downgrading the performance of chips intended to be shipped to the PRC market enough to comply with the letter of current export restrictions while maintaining most of the chips' practical utility for Al training
- Continuing to pursue efforts to manufacture advanced chips in mainland China³⁵

Facing the above means of skirting or otherwise nullifying US export restrictions, US policy has continued to evolve. In September, for example, BIS published a new rule that <u>prohibits</u> the export of advanced chipmaking tools to the PRC without an export license.³⁶ However, according to the *New York Times* report, the effectiveness of the export restrictions thus far has been <u>limited</u>, and entities connected with the PLA continue to obtain chips that support military AI applications.³⁷

The PRC's use of a variety of tactics to evade US export restrictions shows key aspects of China's economic toolkit: specifically using intermediate entities to purchase off-limits technology and forming partnerships with foreign firms to access technology. For example, the *New York Times* report notes that PRC executives from Sugon—a company with PLA ties that had been put on the US Commerce Department's Entity List in 2019—created a new company called Nettrix shortly thereafter that acquired chips for its servers from Nvidia, Intel, and Microsoft. According to the report, Nettrix shares an office complex with Sugon in the city of Kunshan, and procurement documents indicate that Nettrix has sold server equipment containing Nvidia and Intel chips to some of Sugon's former customers, including universities that host defense labs.

NOTES

_

¹ Hayley Wong, "China Says Drones and Counter-Drone Systems Will Dominate at Biggest Zhuhai Air Show Yet," *South China Morning Post*, Sept. 26, 2024, https://www.scmp.com/news/china/military/article/3279952/china-says-drones-and-counter-drone-systems-will-dominate-biggest-zhuhai-air-show-yet; "15th China International Aviation and Space Exhibition Press Conference Held in Beijing [第十五届中国国际航空航天博览会新闻发布会在京举行]," Xinhua [新华], Sept. 26, 2024, https://www.bj.xinhuanet.com/20240926/106d285c8a3f451ba0e4c2aa208bdc6e/c.html.

² Wong, "China Says Drones and Counter-Drone Systems Will Dominate"; Zachary Williams, "Takeaways from China's Zhuhai Air Show 2022," *Diplomat*, Nov. 21, 2022, https://thediplomat.com/2022/11/takeaways-from-chinas-zhuhai-air-show-2022/.

- ³ Wong, "China Says Drones and Counter-Drone Systems will Dominate."
- ⁴ Wong, "China Says Drones and Counter-Drone Systems Will Dominate"; "China Electronics Technology Group Corporation," ASPI China Defense Universities Tracker, Aug. 31, 2020, https://unitracker.aspi.org.au/universities/china-electronics-technology-group-corporation/.
- ⁵ Wu Changfeng (吴长锋), "Anti-UAV Radar Makes It Impossible to Hide 'Illegal Flying' [反无人机雷达让'黑飞'无所 遁形]," *Science and Technology Daily* [科技日报], Apr. 21, 2021, https://www.stdaily.com/index/kejixinwen/2021-04/21/content 1118757.shtml.
- ⁶ "China Electronics Technology Group Corporation"; US Attorney's Office, District of Massachusetts, "Two Chinese Nationals Convicted of Illegally Exporting Electronics Components Used in Military Radar and Electronic Warfare," Federal Bureau of Investigation, May 17, 2010, https://archives.fbi.gov/archives/boston/press-releases/2010/bs051710-1.htm.
- ⁷ "CETC," ASPI Mapping China's Tech Giants, https://chinatechmap.aspi.org.au/#/company/cetc; "R&D Lab: Sino-Austrian Electronic Technology Innovation Centre," ASPI Mapping China's Tech Giants, https://chinatechmap.aspi.org.au/#/map/marker-49; "Research Partnership," ASPI Mapping China's Tech Giants, https://chinatechmap.aspi.org.au/#/map/marker-87; "Research Partnership: University of Manchester Partnership," ASPI Mapping China's Tech Giants, https://chinatechmap.aspi.org.au/#/map/marker-86.
- ⁸ "R&D Lab: Sino-Austrian Electronic Technology Innovation Centre"; "Research Partnership: University of Technology Sydney Partnership;" "Research Partnership: University of Manchester Partnership"; "UTS CETC Review," University of Technology Sydney, https://www.uts.edu.au/news/media-contacts/uts-cetc-review.
- ⁹ "About TWZ," The War Zone, accessed Oct. 10, 2024, https://www.twz.com/about.
- ¹⁰ Thomas Newdick, "Laser Weapon Appears on Chinese Amphibious Assault Ship," The War Zone, Aug. 19, 2024, https://www.twz.com/sea/laser-weapon-appears-on-chinese-amphibious-assault-ship.
- 11 Huang Wenzheng (黄文静), Zhao Zhe (赵哲), and Liu Nanyang (刘南洋), "Directed Energy Weapons Have Advantages Against Swarms [定向能武器反"蜂群" 有优势]," *PLA Daily* [解放军报], Feb. 27, 2024, http://www.81.cn/szb_223187/szbxq/index.html?paperName=jfjb&paperDate=2024-02-27&paperNumber=07&articleid=925948.
- ¹² Li Yan, "Lasers: An Effective Anti-Drone Tool [激光:反制无人机的利器]," *PLA Daily* [解放军报], May 10, 2024, http://www.81.cn/szb_223187/szbxq/index.html?paperName=jfjb&paperDate=2024-05-10&paperNumber=10&articleid=930785.
- ¹³ Christopher F. Schuetze, "Germany Arrests 3 Suspected of Passing Secrets to China," *New York Times*, Apr. 22, 2024, <a href="https://www.nytimes.com/2024/04/22/world/europe/germany-china-spying-arrests.html#:~:text=Three%20German%20citizens%20who%20are%20believed%20to%20have,nature%20of%20the%20relationship%20between%20the%20two%20countries; CNA, *Intersections*, Issue 10, DNL-2023-U-037272-Final4, June 2024, https://www.cna.org/our-media/newsletters/intersections.
- ¹⁴ Wang Shangjian (王尚建) and Liu Ying (刘应), "Overview of the China-Laos 'Friendship Shield-2024' Joint Exercise [中老'友谊盾牌-2024' 联合演习综述']," *PLA Daily* [解放军报], July 20, 2024, http://www.81.cn/yw_208727/16325732.html; "China's Military Sends Troops to Laos for 2-Week Joint Military Drills," RFA, July 9, 2024, https://www.rfa.org/english/news/laos/joint-military-exercises-07092024141357.html.
- ¹⁵ Wang and Liu, "Overview of the China-Laos 'Friendship Shield-2024' Joint Exercise."

¹⁶ "The Enemy of Drones Has Arrived! Anti-Drone Equipment Appears on the Scene at the China-Laos Joint Exercise [无人机克星来了! 反制无人机作战装备 亮相中老联演现场]," *National Defense and Military Morning Post* [国防军事早报], July 17, 2024, http://www.81.cn/yw_208727/16325230.html.

¹⁷ "The Enemy of Drones Has Arrived!"; Fan Enda (范恩达), "Shuttles: Aerial 'Racecar Drivers' [穿梭机:空中'赛车手']," *PLA Daily* [解放军报], Nov. 3, 2023,

http://www.81.cn/szb_223187/szbxq/index.html?paperName=jfjb&paperDate=2023-11-

03&paperNumber=09&articleid=918492; "China-Laos 'Friendship Shield-2024' Joint Exercise, Follow Laos Military Reporter and Visit Unmanned Equipment on the Exercise Field [中老'友谊盾牌-2024'联合演习 跟随老挝军事记者探访演习场上的无人装备]," CCTV [央视网], July 17, 2024,

https://tv.cctv.com/2024/07/17/VIDEjEuswEDwLBPI3e1tK2X8240717.shtml?spm=C53074552346.P4BWJvVoMUky.0.0.

¹⁸ "China-Laos 'Friendship Shield-2024' Joint Exercise, Follow Laos Military Reporter and Visit Equipment on the Exercise Field;" "The Enemy of Drones Has Arrived!"; Kelsey Atherton, "Mass-Market Military Drones Have Changed the Way Wars Are Fought," *MIT Technology Review*, Jan. 30, 2023,

https://www.technologyreview.com/2023/01/30/1067348/mass-market-military-drones-have-changed-the-way-wars-are-fought/.

- ¹⁹ "China-Laos 'Friendship Shield-2024' Joint Exercise, Follow Laos Military Reporter and Visit Unmanned Equipment on the Exercise Field"; "The Enemy of Drones Has Arrived!"; Fan, "Shuttles: Aerial 'Racecar Drivers'"; "Is China at the Forefront of Drone Technology?," China Power, May 29, 2018, https://chinapower.csis.org/china-drones-unmanned-technology/. To preliminarily attribute the remote controller shown in the video, we compared the controller in the video to a model on DJI's website, specifically the DJI RC Motion 2. Both controllers are a similar color and shape and are held in one hand. The DJI RC Motion 2 is meant to allow the user to control the drone's flight with their hand movements. In the footage of the exercise, the drone operator is shown tilting the controller in a similar way as users of the DJI RC Motion 2 on the DJI website. See "DJI RC Motion 2," DJI, https://www.dji.com/rc-motion-2; and "China-Laos 'Friendship Shield-2024' Joint Exercise, Follow Laos Military Reporter and Visit Unmanned Equipment on the Exercise Field."
- ²⁰ "Is China at the Forefront of Drone Technology?"
- ²¹ Cate Cadell, "Drone Company DJI Obscured Ties to Chinese State Funding, Documents Show," *Washington Post*, Feb. 1, 2022, https://www.washingtonpost.com/national-security/2022/02/01/china-funding-drones-dji-us-regulators/.
- ²² Matthew Kroenig and Imran Bayoumi, "A Global Strategy to Secure UAS Supply Chains," The Atlantic Council, June 25, 2024, https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/in-depth-research-reports/issue-brief/a-global-strategy-to-secure-uas-supply-chains/.
- ²³ "Military-Civil Fusion and the People's Republic of China," US Department of State, May 2020, https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/What-is-MCF-One-Pager.pdf.
- ²⁴ Kroenig and Bayoumi, "A Global Strategy to Secure UAS Supply Chains"; "Is China at the Forefront of Drone Technology?"
- ²⁵ Stephen Chen, "China's Powerful Advanced Sonar Systems Are Now Small Enough to Fit on Unmanned Submersibles," *South China Morning Post*, Mar. 23, 2024, https://www.scmp.com/news/china/science/article/3255947/chinas-powerful-advanced-sonar-systems-are-now-small-enough-fit-unmanned-submersibles.
- ²⁶ Chen, "China's Powerful Advanced Sonar Systems."
- ²⁷ "Harbin Engineering University," ASPI China Defense Universities Tracker, https://unitracker.aspi.org.au/universities/harbin-engineering-university/.

- ²⁸ Ma Xiu, *The PRC State and Defense Laboratory System, Part Two: Defense S&T Key Lab Directory*, China Aerospace Studies Institute, Mar. 2023, https://www.airuniversity.af.edu/CASI/Display/Article/3335234/prc-defense-st-key-lab-directory/.
- ²⁹ "Florida Woman Sentenced to Prison for Acting as an Illegal Agent of a Foreign Government and Conspiring to Commit Money Laundering," US Department of Justice, Sept. 26, 2016, https://www.justice.gov/opa/pr/florida-woman-sentenced-prison-acting-illegal-agent-foreign-government-and-conspiring-commit.
- 30 "Florida Woman Sentenced to Prison."
- ³¹ "Commerce Implements New Export Controls on Advanced Computing and Semiconductor Manufacturing Items to the People's Republic of China (PRC)," US Commerce Department Bureau of Industry and Security, Oct. 7, 2022, https://www.bis.doc.gov/index.php/documents/about-bis/newsroom/press-releases/3158-2022-10-07-bis-press-release-advanced-computing-and-semiconductor-manufacturing-controls-final/file.
- ³² "Commerce Strengthens Restrictions on Advanced Computing Semiconductors, Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment, and Supercomputing Items to Countries of Concern," US Commerce Department Bureau of Industry and Security, Oct. 17, 2023, https://www.bis.gov/press-release/commerce-strengthens-restrictions-advanced-computing-semiconductors-semiconductors.
- ³³ "Commerce Releases Clarifications of Export Control Rules to Restrict the PRC's Access to Advanced Computing and Supercomputing Items and Semiconductor Manufacturing Equipment," US Commerce Department Bureau of Industry and Security, Apr. 4, 2024, https://www.bis.gov/press-release/commerce-releases-clarifications-export-control-rules-restrict-prcs-access-advanced.
- ³⁴ Ana Swanson and Claire Fu, "With Smugglers and Front Companies, China Is Skirting American Al Bans," *New York Times*, Aug. 4, 2024, https://www.nytimes.com/2024/08/04/technology/china-ai-microchips.html?searchResultPosition=1.
- ³⁵ Kate Irwin, "Nvidia AI GPUs Are Flowing into China Through Underground Network," *PC Mag*, July 3, 2024, https://www.pcmag.com/news/nvidia-ai-gpus-a100-smuggled-into-china-through-underground-network; Swanson and Fu, "With Smugglers and Front Companies."
- ³⁶ Cheng Ting-fang, Lauly Li, and Katherine Creel, "US Implements New Export Curbs on Advanced Chips and Quantum Tech," *Nikkei Asia*, Sept. 6, 2024, https://asia.nikkei.com/Business/Technology/U.S.-implements-new-export-curbs-on-advanced-chips-and-quantum-tech.
- ³⁷ Ana Swanson, "Takeaways from Our Investigation into Banned Al Chips in China," *New York Times*, Aug. 4, 2024, https://www.nytimes.com/2024/08/04/technology/china-ai-microchips-takeaways.html.

Intersections is produced by CNA's China and Indo-Pacific Security Affairs Division. The division's team of approximately three dozen language-skilled regional specialists has provided sponsors and the public with the context to make informed, data-based assessments about this critical region since 1998.

For additional information, please contact INTERSECTIONS@CNA.ORG.

Approved November 2024: Maryanne Kivlehan-Wise, Research Program Director

China Studies Program, China and Indo-Pacific Security Affairs Division

This work was created in the performance of Federal Government Contract No. N00014-22-D-7001.

DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT A. Cleared for Public Release.

Public Release 11/6/2024

This document contains the best opinion of CNA at the time of issue. The views, opinions, and findings contained in this report should not be construed as representing the official position of the Department of the Navy.

Any copyright in this work is subject to the Government's Unlimited Rights license as defined in DFARS 252.227-7013 and/or DFARS 252.227-7014. The reproduction of this work for commercial purposes is strictly prohibited. Nongovernmental users may copy and distribute this document noncommercially, in any medium, provided that the copyright notice is reproduced in all copies. Nongovernmental users may not use technical measures to obstruct or control the reading or further copying of the copies they make or distribute. Nongovernmental users may not accept compensation of any manner in exchange for copies.

All other rights reserved. The provision of this data and/or source code is without warranties or guarantees to the Recipient Party by the Supplying Party with respect to the intended use of the supplied information. Nor shall the Supplying Party be liable to the Recipient Party for any errors or omissions in the supplied information.

This report may contain hyperlinks to websites and servers maintained by third parties. CNA does not control, evaluate, endorse, or guarantee content found in those sites. We do not assume any responsibility or liability for the actions, products, services, and content of those sites or the parties that operate them.

CNA is a nonprofit research and analysis organization dedicated to the safety and security of the nation. It operates the Center for Naval Analyses—the only federally funded research and development center serving the Department of the Navy—as well as the Institute for Public Research. CNA is dedicated to developing actionable solutions to complex problems of national importance.

DNL-2024-U-039879-Final

Subscribe or unsubscribe at intersections@cna.org